



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1:

Journal Name:	<u>Physical Review & Research International</u>
Manuscript Number:	MS: 2013_PRRI_4020
Title of the Manuscript:	An Evaluation of the As, Cd, Mn and Hg Contamination in Soils and Plants (<i>Amaranthus Spinosis</i>) of Kaduna Metropolis Dumpsites
Type of the Article	Research paper

General guideline for Peer Review process is available in this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)

- This form has total 7 parts. Kindly note that you should use all the parts of this review form.



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 2: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<u>Compulsory</u> REVISION comments	My review for this publication is: This research paper covers a very important area of environmental pollution. However, the study lacks some very important information before it could be considered for publication. The study contains only one time measurements of wet season and dry season. Information on rainfall, size of dump sites, international soil classification, what type of crops are grown in the area and by farmers, why this particular test crop was selected, and what common name of the crop is, etc is missing. There is this one not very scientific term, "Transfer Factor" used in the text. What this term signifies and what units it has and how this absorption of toxic ions is not explained in terms of CEC (what these units of Cmol/kg for CEC mean), how measurements of electrical conductivity help Transfer factor/absorption, organic matter and water content values are expressed on oven dry basis or what. It would be nice to get trend of toxic ions absorption as a function of time (means more than one year data). The study has a limited scope of application and it should be widened. I also agree with whatever comments the previous	Measurements at the wet season and dry seasons were taken because the research is a M.Sc research of 12 months duration. However, other candidates are investigating for some seasons. Rainfall, crops grown in the area, why Amaranthus spinosis was selected and its common name have been included. site sizes, and international soil classification are now addressed. .Cmol/kg means centimol per kilogram Relationship between transfer factor, organic matter and water content have been explained in the text. Transfer factor signifies degree of metal uptake from the soil by plant roots. It has no unit since it is a ratio and it is a scientific term used in several journals e.g Afr. J. Environ. Sci. Technol.etc



SDI Review Form 1.6

	reviewer has made. I would suggest a major revision of this publication in light of comments I have made. Then consider it for specific comments and suggestions.	As earlier mentioned this research is an Msc. Research having 12 months duration.
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments		